

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
SHERMAN DIVISION**

VIRGINIA INNOVATION SCIENCES, INC.,

Plaintiff,  
v.

AMAZON.COM, INC., et al.

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 4:18-cv-00474-ALM  
(LEAD CONSOLIDATED CASE)

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

INNOVATION SCIENCES, LLC,

Plaintiff,  
v.

RESIDEO TECHNOLOGIES, INC.,

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 4:18-cv-00475-ALM

INNOVATION SCIENCES, LLC,

Plaintiff,  
v.

HTC CORPORATION,

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 4:18-cv-00476-ALM

INNOVATION SCIENCES, LLC,

Plaintiff,  
v.

VECTOR SECURITY, INC.,

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 4:18-cv-00477-ALM

**NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY REGARDING  
DEFENDANTS' REQUEST FOR CLARIFICATION OF MODEL ORDER  
FOCUSING PATENT CLAIMS AND PRIOR ART TO REDUCE COSTS**

Defendants Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon Digital Services, LLC, Amazon Web Services, Inc., Resideo Technologies, Inc., HTC Corporation, and Vector Security, Inc. (collectively, “Defendants”) respectfully submit this Notice of Supplemental Authority Regarding Defendants’ Request for Clarification of Model Order Focusing Patent Claims and Prior Art to Reduce Costs (Dkt. 121). In the orders listed below and attached, courts in this district permitted defendants in consolidated cases to submit their own independent election of prior art references and did not impose a collective limit on prior art among defendants:

- **Exhibit 1:** *Motiva Patents, LLC v. Sony Corp. et al.*, No. 9:18-cv-00180 (E.D. Tex. Apr. 15, 2019), Dkt. 78 at 2 (requiring prior art elections by “each defendant”);
- **Exhibit 2:** *Realtime Data LLC d/b/a IXO v. Actian Corp. et al.*, No. 15-cv-00463-RWS (E.D. Tex. Sept. 9, 2015), Dkt. 96 at 2 (requiring prior art elections by “each defendant”);
- **Exhibit 3:** *Manitto Techs., L.L.C. v. Ferrari N. Am., Inc. et al.*, No. 14-cv-1105 RWS (E.D. Tex. June 1, 2015), Dkt. 64 at 1-2 (“each patent defendant shall serve a Preliminary Election of Asserted Prior Art, wherein each shall assert no more than eighteen prior art references of each defendant’s own choosing”); and
- **Exhibit 4:** *Phoenix Licensing, L.L.C. et al. v. AAA Life Ins. Co.*, No. 13-cv-1081-JRG-RSP, Dkt. 402 at 2 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 11, 2015) (requiring prior art elections by “each defendant”).

Defendants discovered these orders after briefing on this motion closed and submit them now in light of the Court’s comments during the telephonic hearing of July 2, 2019, to show the weight of authority on the issue presented by the motion.

July 2, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Ravi R. Ranganath

J. David Hadden  
CA Bar No. 176148 (Admitted E.D. Tex.)  
Email: dhadden@fenwick.com  
Saina S. Shamilov  
CA Bar No. 215636 (Admitted E.D. Tex.)  
Email: sshamilov@fenwick.com  
Ravi R. Ranganath  
CA Bar No. 272981 (Admitted E.D. Tex.)  
Email: rranganath@fenwick.com  
**FENWICK & WEST LLP**  
Silicon Valley Center  
801 California Street  
Mountain View, CA 94041  
Telephone: (650) 988-8500  
Facsimile: (650) 938-5200  
Todd R. Gregorian  
CA Bar No. 236096 (Admitted E.D. Tex.)  
Email: tgregorian@fenwick.com

Dargaye Churnet  
CA Bar No. 303659 (Admitted E.D. Tex.)  
Email: dchurnet@fenwick.com  
**FENWICK & WEST LLP**  
555 California Street, 12th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: 415.875.2300  
Facsimile: 415.281.1350

Jeffrey Ware  
CA Bar No. 271603 (Admitted E.D. Tex.)  
Email: jware@fenwick.com  
**FENWICK & WEST LLP**  
1191 Second Avenue, 10th Floor  
Seattle, WA 98101  
Telephone: 206.389.4510  
Facsimile: 206.389.4511

Melissa R. Smith  
State Bar No. 24001351  
**GILLAM & SMITH, LLP**  
303 South Washington Avenue  
Marshall, Texas 75670  
Telephone: (903) 934-8450  
Facsimile: (903) 934-9257  
Email: melissa@gillamsmithlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants*  
AMAZON.COM, INC.,  
AMAZON DIGITAL SERVICES LLC,  
AND AMAZON WEB SERVICES, INC.

/s/ Philip Ou

Yar R. Chaikovsky  
CA Bar No. 175421(admitted E.D. Tex.)  
yarchaikovsky@paulhastings.com  
Philip Ou  
CA Bar No. 259896 (admitted E.D. Tex.)  
philipou@paulhastings.com  
**PAUL HASTINGS, LLP**  
1117 S. California Avenue  
Palo Alto, California 94304-1106  
Telephone: 1(650) 320-1800  
Facsimile: 1(650) 320-1900

Harry L. Gillam, Jr.  
TX Bar No. 07921800  
**GILLAM & SMITH LLP**  
303 S. Washington Ave.  
Marshall, Texas 75670  
Telephone: (903) 934-8450  
Facsimile: (903) 934-9257  
gil@gillamsmithlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant  
**HTC CORPORATION**

/s/ Melody Drummond Hansen

J. Thad Heartfield  
**The Heartfield Law Firm**  
2195 Dowlen Rd  
Beaumont, TX 77706  
409-866-3318  
409-866-5789 (fax)  
thad@heartfieldlawfirm.com

Brett J. Williamson  
Cameron Westin  
**O'Melveny & Myers LLP - Newport Beach, CA**  
610 Newport Center Drive, 17th Floor  
Newport Beach, CA 92660  
949-823-6900  
949-823-6994 (fax)  
bwilliamson@omm.com

Brian M. Berliner  
**O'Melveny & Myers LLP - LA**  
400 South Hope Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
213-430-6000  
213-430-6407 (fax)  
bberliner@omm.com

Melody Drummond Hansen  
**O'Melveny & Myers LLP Menlo Park**  
2765 Sand Hill Road  
Menlo Park, CA 94025  
650-473-2600  
650-473-2601 (fax)  
mdrummondhansen@omm.com

*Counsel for Defendant*  
**RESIDEO TECHNOLOGIES, INC.**

/s/ Bret T. Winterle  
Bret T. Winterle  
Texas Bar No. 24084249  
winterle@fr.com Neil J. McNabney  
Texas Bar No. 24002583  
mcnabney@fr.com  
Michael A. Vincent  
Texas Bar No. 24105738  
vincent@fr.com  
Collin J. Marshall  
Texas Bar No. 24109509  
cmarshall@fr.com  
1717 Main Street, Suite 5000  
Dallas, Texas 75201  
(214) 747-5070 Telephone  
(214) 747-2091 Facsimile

*Counsel for Defendant*  
**VECTOR SECURITY, INC.**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service are being served with a copy of this document via the Court's CM/ECF system per Local Rule CV-5(a)(3) on July 2, 2019.

*/s/ Ravi R. Ranganath*

---

Ravi R. Ranganath